

Table of contents

Part 1:

Democratic oversight of the security sector in member states

<i>Report of the Parliamentary Assembly</i>	11
Summary	11
Adopted texts.....	12
Recommendation 1713 (2005) of the Parliamentary Assembly to the Committee of Ministers and its reply	12
Explanatory memorandum.....	23
A. Introduction	23
B. Intelligence services	25
<i>i. Relevance to national security</i>	25
<i>ii. Recent trends</i>	26
<i>iii. Democratic oversight</i>	29
<i>iv. Challenges and concerns</i>	34
C. Democratic policing.....	35
<i>i. Relevance to national security</i>	35
<i>ii. Trends in the wake of 9/11</i>	35
<i>iii. Oversight and accountability</i>	36
<i>iv. Problems and challenges</i>	37
D. Border management.....	40
<i>i. Relevance to national security</i>	40
<i>ii. Obligations of border guards to respect the human rights of refugees and asylum seekers</i>	41
<i>iii. Oversight</i>	42

E. Defence.....	45
i. <i>Overseeing security in the defence sector</i>	45
ii. <i>A few examples</i>	47
iii. <i>Supervision of European security policy</i>	50
Part 2:	
Democratic oversight of the security services	
<i>Report of the European Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission)</i>	53
Executive summary.....	53
I. Introduction	58
II. Previous Council of Europe work in this area	59
A. The Venice Commission study	59
B. The Group of Specialists on Internal Security Services (PC-S-SEC) of the European Committee on Crime Problems (CDPC)	61
C. The Council of Europe Secretary General's supplementary report	61
III. The scope of the present study.....	62
IV. Is there a need for (improved) democratic control?.....	63
V. Accountability	68
A. The notion and forms of accountability	68
B. General problems in ensuring accountability.....	70
C. Constitutional and organisational contexts.....	73
a. <i>In general</i>	73
b. <i>The organisation of the security services</i>	74
c. <i>The form of the mandate of the security services</i>	76
d. <i>Security priorities</i>	77
e. <i>Internal control</i>	78
f. <i>Governmental control</i>	79
g. <i>Particular accountability problems relating to international co-operation between intelligence agencies</i>	80
VI. Accountability and the case law of the European Court of Human Rights	82

VII. Internal and governmental controls as part of overall accountability systems	85
VIII. Parliamentary accountability.....	90
A. In general	90
B. Mandate and functions of the parliamentary oversight body	92
C. Membership of the oversight body	97
D. Oversight and international co-operation	99
E. Other areas where the parliament can be given a role in accountability	102
IX. Judicial review and authorisation	104
X. Accountability to expert bodies	113
XI. Complaints mechanisms	120
XII. Concluding remarks.....	123

Part 3:

Democratic control of the armed forces

<i>Report of the European Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission)</i>	125
Executive summary.....	125
I. Introduction	131
II. The scope of the study	132
III. The necessity for democratic control of the armed forces	136
A. The domestic dimension	140
B. The international dimension	142
IV. The role of the armed forces in Council of Europe member states.....	148
A. External roles of the armed forces.....	150
1. <i>Defence against external threats</i>	151
2. <i>Collective defence</i>	151
3. <i>Peacekeeping, crisis management and peace-building operations</i> ..	151

B. Internal roles of the armed forces	153
1. Military assistance in maintaining public order	154
a. Counter-terrorism operations	154
b. Protection of public buildings and installations	155
c. Protection of borders, coastal waters and airspace	155
2. Military assistance in case of disasters	156
3. Other activities of the armed forces	157
V. Actors, acts, moments and procedures of control	158
A. General overview	158
B. Domestic level	162
1. Preliminary issues	162
a. Historical context of national democracies	162
b. Forms of government	163
c. Constitutional rules	163
d. The control organ	165
2. The role of parliaments	165
a. Organs involved	166
b. Acts and issues under control	172
c. Mechanisms of control	181
3. The role of the executive	188
a. Organs involved	189
b. Acts and issues under control, and mechanisms of control	193
4. The role of the judiciary	197
a. The role of the constitutional courts	198
b. Constitutional provisions referring to military jurisdiction	199
5. Other oversight entities	202
a. Ombudsmen	202
b. Audit offices and courts of auditors	206
6. Internal control mechanisms on armed forces	207
a. Codes of conduct or professional ethics	208
b. Command responsibility	208

C. International dimension of the control	209
1. Preliminary issues	211
a. Legal and illegal foreign military presence	211
b. International organisations	219
c. Legitimate character of the use of force and the international body authorising it	220
2. Organs involved	220
a. Intergovernmental institutions	220
b. Inter-parliamentary dimension of the control	225
c. International courts	230
3. International standards	233
a. International treaties	234
b. Codes of conduct	236
c. The CIS model law: a comparative perspective	237
VI. Conclusions	238

Appendices

Appendix A: Overview of national legislation on the authority to decide participation in missions abroad	244
Appendix B: Overview of the constitutional rules of appointment of top commanders in selected Council of Europe member states	252
Appendix C: Overview of civil and political rights for armed forces personnel: selected examples	259